12 DCSW2008/2206/F - PROPOSED REPLACEMENT OF EXISTING BUNGALOW WITH PERMISSION TO EXTEND WITH NEW TWO STOREY DWELLING OF SAME SIZE AS EXTENDED BUNGALOW, ALDERMEAD COTTAGE, LLANWARNE, HEREFORDSHIRE, HR2 8JE.

For: Mr T Russell per Paul Brice Architect, Lower Barn, Rockfield, Monmouth, NP25 5QD.

Date Received: 1 September 2008Ward: PontrilasGrid Ref: 50099, 28248Expiry Date: 27 October 2008Local Member:Councillor RH Smith

1. Site Description and Proposal

- 1.1 The proposal site is on the western fringe of Llanwarne. It is reached off the eastern side of the unclassified road (71601) that leads north-westwards towards Lyston Smithy and the A466. The unadopted road serving Aldermead also has a public footpath running along it. This road also serves Aldermead.
- 1.2 The application property was formerly an annexe to Aldermead immediately to the east. This detached red brick bungalow was subsequently the subject of a planning application removing a condition restricting it for use as annexe, such that it could be lived in as a separate dwelling. The single-storey property also has the benefit of an extant planning permission for an extension granted in February 2004 (reference: SW2003/3879/F).
- 1.3 The proposal is to demolish the red brick faced bungalow and to replace it with a coursed stonework building, which would then be lime-washed, the fenestration would be painted softwood and the roof a natural grey slate. The existing bungalow is 4.1 metres to the ridge, the new dwelling would be 1.7 metres higher at 5.8 metres to the ridge. The first floor accommodation is within the roof space which is punctuated by two dormer windows to the front elevation and one to the rear. There are no windows in the east facing gable end facing Aldermead.
- 1.4 The new dwelling would be sited behind the line of the rear boundary of Aldermead and would be parallel with the east and west boundaries of the site which declines from north to south.

2. Policies

2.1 Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan

Policy DR1	-	Design	
Policy DR2	-	Land Use and Activity	
Policy T8	-	Road Hierarchy	
Policy H7	-	Housing in the Countryside Outside Settlements	
Policy H13	-	Sustainable Residential Design	
Policy HBA8	-	Locally Important Buildings	

3. Planning History

3.1	SH830290PO	Granny annexe flat as bungalow -	Approved 30.06.83
	SH950779PF	Removal of condition no. 3 - (SH830290PO)	Approved 04.10.95
	SE1999/1700/F	Proposed extension and - alterations	Approved 09.09.99
	SW2003/3879/F	Removal of planning permission - SE1999/1700/F	Approved 19.02.04

4. Consultation Summary

Statutory Consultations

4.1 No statutory or non-statutory consultations required.

Internal Council Advice

4.2 The Traffic Manager states that the proposal will have no significant impact on the highway, and has no objection.

5. Representations

- 5.1 In a Design and Access Statement that accompanied the application, the following main points are raised:
 - Llanwarne small hamlet, half a mile west of A466 Road
 - Aldermead Cottage is a small late 20th Century bungalow built in grounds of large house
 - current owners could implement extant scheme for extension and alterations such that little of existing fabric would remain unchanged. Resultant building too large for plot
 - a two storey dwelling, replacing the ageing bungalow built in traditional style, but using modern techniques with better Green credentials
 - volume of extended bungalow 346.5m³, cottage occupies smaller footprint and has a volume of 346.0m³
 - existing services utilised, i.e. electricity, foul and surface water disposal and access
 - design is intentionally not innovative
 - lime-washed well proportioned random rubble stone cottage. Roof slope kept to a minimum with use of dormer windows
 - remains subservient to Aldermead, a large Georgian rendered and slate roofed house
 - painted timber windows (recessed) and stone cills
 - vernacular materials used, i.e. natural slate, softwood fascias, bargeboards, doors and windows.

Access

- good access to facilities in Hereford 8 miles away
- driveway access is off a public highway
- principal entrance to dwelling is level.
- 5.2 Llanwarne Parish Council has no objections.
- 5.3 One letter of objection has been received from:

M & L Wood-Power, Aldermead, Llanwarne, HR2 8JE

The following main points are raised:

- not a cottage, an annexe of one bedroom, kitchen, sitting room and bathroom
- our property is not a large grand house, but two workman's cottages made into one
- driveway is a public footpath used by many families, many children use it as a safe place to play
- no turning point on driveway
- more traffic, restricted access through village
- applicant does not live in village, owns other properties
- devalue our property and restrict view from our property, (lost sale due to this application
- new building almost doubles size of extended building
- no objections to extant approval, 2 storey 3 bedroom house totally unreasonable.

The full text of these letters can be inspected at Southern Planning Services, Garrick House, Widemarsh Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officer's Appraisal

- 6.1 The main issues are considered to be the principle of development, the means of access and the potential impact upon the amenities of the adjacent property.
- 6.2 The new dwelling replaces a building which is not of architectural or historical interest such that its retention overrides the principle of redeveloping the site. The existing building, which is no longer an annexe but a property which can be lived in independently from Aldermead, is incongruous as regards materials and its relationship to the much more traditional Aldermead. Therefore, the principle of demolishing the existing bungalow is accepted given that it satisfies the provisions of Policy HBA8.
- 6.3 The next issue relates to the size and form of the new dwelling as compared to the existing bungalow together with the extant planning permission for an extension to it. It is evident that the footprint for the new dwelling will be less than that of the bungalow as extended. It is though 1.7 metres higher than the bungalow it replaces. The first floor accommodation is within a roof slope which limits the overall height to an acceptable 5.8 metres. It is not considered that the replacement of a bungalow by a two-storey dwelling would always necessarily be supported, it would depend upon the context of that particular site and the merits of each application. In this instance the volume of the extended bungalow and the new dwelling are almost directly comparable. Furthermore, the proposed new dwelling, by reason of the design and

appearance, would enhance the character of this part of Llanwarne which is visible from the A466 road.

- 6.4 The means of access is satisfactory. Whilst it is difficult to turn into the site, this is a matter that, even though the Traffic Manager has not objected, can be made the subject of a planning condition. It is not considered that the additional traffic from a three bedroom dwelling as opposed to a two bedroom bungalow would be such that planning permission could be resisted on those grounds alone.
- 6.5 The new dwelling will have an appearance which respects the local vernacular with the use of stone, slate and painted timber detailing and it will only be 1.7 metres higher to the ridge than the existing dwelling. It will not materially restrict the views of occupants of Aldermead to the east, which in any case is not a planning matter and furthermore will have no discernable impact on the privacy and general amenities of the neighbouring property.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

1. A01 (Time limit for commencement (full permission))

Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. B02 (Development in accordance with approved plans and materials)

Reason: To ensure adherence to the approved plans and to protect the general character and amenities of the area in accordance with the requirements of Policy DR1 of Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan

3. H10 (Parking - single house)

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and to ensure the free flow of traffic using the adjoining highway and to conform with the requirements of Policy T11 of Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan

4. F14 (Removal of permitted development rights)

Reason: In order to protect the character and amenity of the locality, to maintain the amenities of adjoining property and to comply with Policy H13 of Herefordshire Unitary Development Plan.

Informatives:

- 1. N19 Avoidance of doubt Approved Plans
- 2. N15 Reason(s) for the Grant of Planning Permission

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.

